(Making)
Shared Decision Making
Part of “Usual Care”

Healthy Dialogues
August 26, 2014
David E Wennberg, MD, MPH
What We Will Cover

Shared Decision Making

1. Profile of the Issue

2. Are Physicians and Patients on the Same Page?

3. Is There Evidence that Doing the Right Thing Can Result in Doing Well?

4. Wrapping it up...
Providers’ Perspective or at Least it Should Be…

Shared Decision Making

“healthcare that establishes a partnership among practitioners, patients and their families (when appropriate) to ensure that decisions reflect patients’ wants, needs and preferences and that patients have the education and support they need to make decisions and participate in their own care”
Profile of the Issue

Shared Decision Making

- Preference Sensitive Care

  - Care for conditions where treatment options exist
    - Treating stable heart disease, joint arthritis, early stage breast cancer, etc.

  - Where the treatment options involve significant tradeoffs in the quality or length of life

  - The choice of treatment should be decided upon by the fully informed patient in partnership with their physician (shared decision making)

Among those with severe arthritis, no more than 15% were definitely willing to undergo (joint replacement), emphasizing the importance of considering both patients’ preference and surgical indications in evaluating need and appropriateness of rates of surgery.
Patient Assumptions

- Patients want to be fully informed
- Informed patients will participate in shared decision making
- Fully informed physicians will honor patients’ values and preferences
- Patients are more risk averse than their physicians
## Physician’s Decision-Making Role

### Preferences

**Shared Decision Making**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preferences</th>
<th>Number of Providers (n=1,050)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preferred to share decision-making with their patients</td>
<td>780 (75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred paternalism</td>
<td>142 (14%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred consumerism</td>
<td>118 (11%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived themselves as practicing their preferred style</td>
<td>87%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Murray E, Pollack L, White M, Lo B. *Clinical decision-making: physicians’ preferences and experiences.* BMC Family Practice. 2007. 8:10
## Patient’s Decision-Making Role Preferences

**Shared Decision Making**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preferences</th>
<th>Number of Patients (n=914)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“I prefer to leave all the decisions regarding my treatment to my doctor.”</td>
<td>102 (11.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I prefer that my doctor make the final decision about which treatment will be used, but seriously consider my opinion.”</td>
<td>225 (24.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I prefer that my doctor and I share responsibility for deciding which treatment is best for me.”</td>
<td>400 (43.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I prefer to make the final selection of my treatments after seriously considering my doctor’s opinion.”</td>
<td>167 (18.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I prefer to make the final decision about the treatment I will receive.”</td>
<td>20 (2.1%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Profile of the Issue

Shared Decision Making

Cardiac Revascularization

Ontario Benchmark
“Informed” Consent?
Shared Decision Making

- In a survey of consecutive patients scheduled for an elective coronary revascularization procedure at Yale New Haven Hospital in 1997-1998
  - 75% believed PCI would help decrease the risk of having a heart attack
  - 71% believed PCI would help them live longer
  - <50% could name 1 possible complication of the procedure
  - 85% were given “informed consented” just before the procedure (by a fellow or an NP)
Patients’ and Cardiologists’ Perceptions of PCI Benefits

Shared Decision Making

Anticipated Benefit

Profile of the Issue

Shared Decision Making

- Reliance on physician decision making
  - Presumes physicians adequately assesses patient’s values and preferences (stay tuned: we will see if that is true...)

- Failure to adequately inform patients of their treatment options
  - Only the patient experiences the risks and the benefits

- Failure to adequately engage patients in informed choice
  - Impact of shared decision making on choice of care
What We Will Cover
Shared Decision Making

1. Profile of the Issue

2. Are Physicians and Patients on the Same Page?

3. Is There Evidence that Doing the Right Thing Can Result in Doing Well?

4. Wrapping it up...
Decision Study Papers

Shared Decision Making

The DECISeONS Study: A Nationwide Survey of United States Adults Regarding 9 Common Medical Decisions

Brian J. Zikmund-Fisher, PhD, Mick P. Couper, PhD, Eleanor Singer, PhD, Carrie A. Levia, PhD, Floyd J. Fowler, Jr., PhD, Sonia Ziegel, PhD

Deficits and Variations in Patients’ Experience with Making 9 Common Medical Decisions: The DECISeONS Survey

Brian J. Zikmund-Fisher, PhD, Mick P. Couper, PhD, Eleanor Singer, PhD, Carrie A. Levia, PhD, Floyd J. Fowler, Jr., PhD, Sonia Ziegel, PhD

Patients’ Knowledge about 9 Common Health Conditions: The DECISeONS Survey

Angela Fagerlin, PhD, Karen R. Sepucha, PhD, Mick P. Couper, PhD, Carrie A. Levia, PhD, Eleanor Singer, PhD, Brian J. Zikmund-Fisher, PhD

Use of the Internet and Ratings of Information Sources for Medical Decisions: Results from the DECISeONS Survey

Mick P. Couper, PhD, Eleanor Singer, PhD, Carrie A. Levia, PhD, Floyd J. Fowler, Jr., PhD, Angela Fagerlin, PhD, Brian J. Zikmund-Fisher, PhD

Background: The rise in Internet use for seeking health information raises questions about the role the Internet plays in helping individuals make decisions about their health. Results: Use of the Internet is associated with improved decision quality and patients who seek information via the Internet are more likely to report that the information helped them make decisions. Implications: Internet use may be beneficial in improving decision-making in both primary and specialty care settings.
We Make a LOT of Health Care Decisions

Shared Decision Making

How many people made a medical decision in the last two years?

![Bar chart showing the proportion of population making decisions on various health conditions and types of decisions.]

- High Blood Pressure: 21%
- High Cholesterol: 26%
- Depression: 12%
- Colon Cancer: 41%
- Breast Cancer (F): 83%
- Prostate Cancer (M): 49%
- Cataract: 8%
- Knee/Hip Replacement: 5%
- Lower Back Pain: 5%

Type of Decisions:
- Medication Initiation
- Cancer Screening
- Elective Surgery

28 August 2014
Are Both Risks and Benefits Discussed?

“Some” or “a lot” of discussion of pros and cons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Discussion</th>
<th>Pros</th>
<th>Cons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High Blood Pressure</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Cholesterol</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depression</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colon Cancer</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breast Cancer (F)</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prostate Cancer (M)</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cataract</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knee/ Hip Replacement</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Back Pain</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Do My Doctors Ask Me About What I Want or Need?

Shared Decision Making

Physician Offered an Opinion, Asked Patient’s Opinion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Discussion</th>
<th>Offered Opinion</th>
<th>Asked Opinion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High Blood Pressure</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Cholesterol</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depression</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colon Cancer</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breast Cancer (F)</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prostate Cancer (M)</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cataract</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knee/hip Replacement</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Back Pain</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cancer Screening</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elective Surgery</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Proportion of Population

84% 85% 78% 84% 80% 80% 85% 78% 82% 41% 45% 74% 34% 38% 46% 77% 61% 76%

28 August 2014
Did I Understand Why I May Need to be Treated or Diagnosed?

**Shared Decision Making**

Mean proportion of knowledge items answered correctly

- **High Blood Pressure**: 0.70
- **High Cholesterol**: 0.50
- **Depression**: 0.30
- **Colon Cancer**: 0.40
- **Breast Cancer (F)**: 0.40
- **Prostate Cancer (M)**: 0.20
- **Cataract**: 0.30
- **Knee/Hip Replacement**: 0.50
- **Lower Back Pain**: 0.20

![Bar Chart showing mean proportion of knowledge items answered correctly for various health conditions and types of discussion.](image)
But... If You Ask Me How Much I Know, I am All Set

Shared Decision Making

On a scale of 0-10, where 0 is not at all informed and 10 is extremely well-informed, how informed do you feel about your decision about (screening, medication, surgery)?
Who Do I Trust?
Shared Decision Making
Importance of Information Sources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information Source</th>
<th>Mean Rating (0-10)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provider</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family &amp; Friends</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* 0 rating assigned to non-users
## Bridging Perspectives: What are the Key Facts?

**Shared Decision Making**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mastectomy</th>
<th>Lumpectomy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SURVIVAL:</strong></td>
<td>Same</td>
<td>Same</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>COSMETICS:</strong></td>
<td>Lose breast</td>
<td>Keep breast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RECURRENCE:</strong></td>
<td>Low (1-5%)</td>
<td>Slightly higher (5-15%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RADIATION:</strong></td>
<td>Not Common</td>
<td>6+ weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ADD. SURGERY:</strong></td>
<td>Rare</td>
<td>Common (20-50%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Lee C, Hultman S, Sepucha K. *Do patients and providers agree about the most important facts and goals for breast reconstruction decisions?* Annals of Plastic Surgery 2010 May; 64(5):563-6.
## Top 3 Things Patients Want or Should Know

**Shared Decision Making**

**Benefits and harms of chemotherapy for breast cancer**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fact</th>
<th>% Top 3 Patients</th>
<th>% Top 3 Providers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chemotherapy reduces recurrence, increases survival</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hormone therapy reduces recurrence, increases survival</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemotherapy common side effects</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemotherapy serious side effects</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hormone therapy common side effects</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hormone therapy serious side effects</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Lee C, Hultman S, Sepucha K. *Do patients and providers agree about the most important facts and goals for breast reconstruction decisions?*" Annals of Plastic Surgery 2010 May; 64(5):563-6.
## Top 3 Goals and Concerns for Breast Cancer Decisions

### Shared Decision Making

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goal / Concern</th>
<th>% Top 3 Patients</th>
<th>% Top 3 Providers</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Surgery: Keep your breast</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconstruction: Look natural without clothes</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemotherapy: Live as long as possible</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconstruction: Avoid using prosthesis</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surgery: Keep your breast</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconstruction: Look natural without clothes</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Lee C, Hultman S, Sepucha K. Do patients and providers agree about the most important facts and goals for breast reconstruction decisions?" Annals of Plastic Surgery 2010 May; 64(5):563-6.
## Is Doing What the Doctor Thinks Best a Top Priority

### Shared Decision Making

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decision</th>
<th>% Top 3 Patients</th>
<th>% Top 3 Providers</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BCA surgery</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hip placement</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knee replacement</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Menopause</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSA</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spinal Stenosis</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Lee C, Hultman S, Sepucha K. *Do patients and providers agree about the most important facts and goals for breast reconstruction decisions?*" Annals of Plastic Surgery 2010 May; 64(5):563-6.
Are Doctors and Patients on the Same Page?

Shared Decision Making

- Patients feel it is critical to do whatever the doctor thinks is best
- Patients and providers focus on different issues
- Delegation of information provision and decision making to providers is problematic
  - Likely to not get information want and need
  - Likely to not get treatments that best match their individual goals and concerns

Lee C, Hultman S, Sepucha K. Do patients and providers agree about the most important facts and goals for breast reconstruction decisions?" Annals of Plastic Surgery 2010 May; 64(5):563-6.
What We Will Cover

Shared Decision Making

1. Profile of the Issue
2. Are Physicians and Patients on the Same Page?
3. Is There Evidence that Doing the Right Thing Can Result in Doing Well?
4. Wrapping it up…
Impact of Shared Decision Making on What People Choose

Shared Decision Making

Definition:

Process between patient and clinician that:

- Engages the patient in decision making
- Provides patient with information about alternative treatments (often includes a decision aid)
- Incorporates patient preferences and values into the medical plan
Use of decision aids show that fully informed patients choose differently than non-informed patients.
Impact of Shared Decision Making on What People Choose

Revascularization Decision in Ontario

Impact of Shared Decision Making on What People Choose?

When engaged in SDM patients are **25% less** likely to choose the invasive treatment for many conditions.

---

**Decision aids for patients facing health treatment or screening decisions: systematic review**

Annette M O'Connor, Alaa Rostom, Valerie Fiset, Jacqueline Tetroe, Vikki Entwistle, Hilary Llewellyn-Thomas, Margaret Holmes-Rovner, Michael Barry, Jean Jones

**Abstract**

**Objective** To conduct a systematic review of randomised trials of patient decision aids in improving decision making and outcomes.

**Design** We included randomised trials of interventions providing structured, detailed, and specific information on treatment or screening options and outcomes to aid decision making. Two reviewers independently screened and extracted data on several evaluation criteria. Results were pooled by using weighted mean differences and relative risks.

**Results** 17 studies met the inclusion criteria. Compared with the controls, decision aids produced higher knowledge scores (weighted mean difference = 19/100, 95% confidence interval 14 to 24).

**Methods**

The search strategy is described in detail elsewhere. We searched the following electronic databases: Medline (1966-April 98); Embase (1980-November 98); PsycINFO (1979-March 98); CINAHL (1988-February 98); Aldisline (1980-98); CancerLit (1983-April 98); and the Cochrane Controlled Trials Register (1998, Issue 4). Additional studies were searched for in

**Source:** O'Connor AM., et al. *Decision aids for people facing health treatment or screening decisions.* Cochrane Database of Systemic Reviews (updated 2010)
Impact of Shared Decision Making on What People Choose

Shared Decision Making

- 26% lower hip replacement surgeries
- 38% lower knee replacement surgeries

What We Will Cover

Shared Decision Makingz

1. Profile of the Issue

2. Are Physicians and Patients on the Same Page?

3. Is There Evidence that Doing the Right Thing Can Result in Doing Well?

4. Wrapping it up...
Adoption of Shared Decision Making on a Large Scale

Shared Decision Making

- Reasons
  - Ethical imperative to do the “right thing”
  - Move from (flawed) informed consent to informed choice
    - Aligning preferences and values with an individual’s clinical decision
  - Bridge health disparities
The Rhode Island Department of Health is investigating Rhode Island Hospital in Providence after the hospital admitted to operating on the wrong body part for another patient, marking at least the fifth wrong-site surgery at the hospital since 2007.

Patient Safety
Shared Decision Making

How do we describe operating on a patient who would say NO to surgery if alternatives, risks and benefits were well understood?
What We Will Cover

Profile of the Issue

Are Physicians and Patients on the Same Page?

Is There Evidence that Doing the Right Thing Can Result in Doing Well?

Wrapping it up...
Thank You!